Skills. Economic Crises and the Labour Market

Kabir Dasgupta (Federal Reserve Board)
Alexander Plum (NZWRI)

62nd NZAE Conference (Wellington)

July 29, 2022





Disclaimer

The results in this paper are not official statistics, they have been created for research purposes from the Integrated Data Infrastructure (IDI) managed by Statistics New Zealand. The opinions, findings, recommendations and conclusions expressed in this paper are those of the author(s) not Statistics NZ. Access to the anonymised data used in this study was provided by Statistics NZ in accordance with security and confidentiality provisions of the Statistics Act 1975. Only people authorised by the Statistics Act 1975 are allowed to see data about a particular person, household, business or organisation and the results in this paper have been confidentialised to protect these groups from identification.

Careful consideration has been given to the privacy, security and confidentiality issues associated with using administrative and survey data in the IDI. Further detail can be found in the Privacy impact assessment for the Integrated Data Infrastructure available from www.stats.govt.nz.

- Do higher skills help mitigate the negative impact of economic crises?
- ► Global Financial Crisis (2007-09); Covid-19 lockdown (2020)
- ► Focus: wage progression
- ► PIAAC survey data on literacy and numeracy skills ↔ Inland Revenue's tax records
- ► GFC: shock on wage progression lower for the higher skilled (employer change)
- ► Covid-19: no differences in wage progression across skill levels population

- Do higher skills help mitigate the negative impact of economic crises?
- ▶ Global Financial Crisis (2007-09); Covid-19 lockdown (2020)
- ► Focus: wage progression
- ► PIAAC survey data on literacy and numeracy skills ↔ Inland Revenue's tax records
- ► GFC: shock on wage progression lower for the higher skilled (employer change)
- Covid-19: no differences in wage progression across skill levels population

- Do higher skills help mitigate the negative impact of economic crises?
- ► Global Financial Crisis (2007-09); Covid-19 lockdown (2020)
- Focus: wage progression
- ► PIAAC survey data on literacy and numeracy skills ↔ Inland Revenue's tax records
- ► GFC: shock on wage progression lower for the higher skilled (employer change)
- ► Covid-19: no differences in wage progression across skill levels population

- Do higher skills help mitigate the negative impact of economic crises?
- ▶ Global Financial Crisis (2007-09); Covid-19 lockdown (2020)
- Focus: wage progression
- ► PIAAC survey data on literacy and numeracy skills ↔ Inland Revenue's tax records
- ► GFC: shock on wage progression lower for the higher skilled (employer change)
- Covid-19: no differences in wage progression across skill levels population

- ▶ Do higher skills help mitigate the negative impact of economic crises?
- ► Global Financial Crisis (2007-09); Covid-19 lockdown (2020)
- Focus: wage progression
- ► PIAAC survey data on literacy and numeracy skills ↔ Inland Revenue's tax records
- ► GFC: shock on wage progression lower for the higher skilled (employer change)
- Covid-19: no differences in wage progression across skill levels population

- Do higher skills help mitigate the negative impact of economic crises?
- ► Global Financial Crisis (2007-09); Covid-19 lockdown (2020)
- Focus: wage progression
- ► PIAAC survey data on literacy and numeracy skills ↔ Inland Revenue's tax records
- GFC: shock on wage progression lower for the higher skilled (employer change)
- ➤ Covid-19: no differences in wage progression across skill levels population

- Human capital: "the knowledge, skills, competencies and other attributes embodied in individuals that are relevant to economic activity"
- ▶ Individual-level like personality characteristics are unobservable
- Educational attainment used as a proxy
- Studies on years of schooling \leftrightarrow labour market performance (Bowen and Finegan, 1966; Leigh, 2008; Forbes et al., 2010)
- Education not a good proxy (alternative means)
- Hanushek et al. (2015): positive relationship between higher cognitive skills—measured (numeracy, literacy, and problem-solving skills) and wages across 23 OECD countries.
- Erwin et al. (2020): adults with low literacy and numeracy skills → less likely to work full time and more likely to be unemployed.

- Human capital: "the knowledge, skills, competencies and other attributes embodied in individuals that are relevant to economic activity"
- ▶ Individual-level like personality characteristics are unobservable
- Educational attainment used as a proxy
- Studies on years of schooling \leftrightarrow labour market performance (Bowen and Finegan, 1966; Leigh, 2008; Forbes et al., 2010)
- Education not a good proxy (alternative means)
- Hanushek et al. (2015): positive relationship between higher cognitive skills—measured (numeracy, literacy, and problem-solving skills) and wages across 23 OECD countries.
- Erwin et al. (2020): adults with low literacy and numeracy skills → less likely to work full time and more likely to be unemployed.

- Human capital: "the knowledge, skills, competencies and other attributes embodied in individuals that are relevant to economic activity"
- ▶ Individual-level like personality characteristics are unobservable
- Educational attainment used as a proxy
- ➤ Studies on years of schooling ↔ labour market performance (Bowen and Finegan, 1966; Leigh, 2008; Forbes et al., 2010)
- ► Education not a good proxy (alternative means)
- Hanushek et al. (2015): positive relationship between higher cognitive skills—measured (numeracy, literacy, and problem-solving skills) and wages across 23 OECD countries.
- Erwin et al. (2020): adults with low literacy and numeracy skills → less likely to work full time and more likely to be unemployed.

- Human capital: "the knowledge, skills, competencies and other attributes embodied in individuals that are relevant to economic activity"
- ▶ Individual-level like personality characteristics are unobservable
- Educational attainment used as a proxy
- Studies on years of schooling \leftrightarrow labour market performance (Bowen and Finegan, 1966; Leigh, 2008; Forbes et al., 2010)
- ► Education not a good proxy (alternative means)
- Hanushek et al. (2015): positive relationship between higher cognitive skills—measured (numeracy, literacy, and problem-solving skills) and wages across 23 OECD countries.
- Erwin et al. (2020): adults with low literacy and numeracy skills → less likely to work full time and more likely to be unemployed.

- Human capital: "the knowledge, skills, competencies and other attributes embodied in individuals that are relevant to economic activity"
- ▶ Individual-level like personality characteristics are unobservable
- Educational attainment used as a proxy
- Studies on years of schooling \leftrightarrow labour market performance (Bowen and Finegan, 1966; Leigh, 2008; Forbes et al., 2010)
- Education not a good proxy (alternative means)
- Hanushek et al. (2015): positive relationship between higher cognitive skills—measured (numeracy, literacy, and problem-solving skills) and wages across 23 OECD countries.
- Erwin et al. (2020): adults with low literacy and numeracy skills → less likely to work full time and more likely to be unemployed.

- Human capital: "the knowledge, skills, competencies and other attributes embodied in individuals that are relevant to economic activity"
- ▶ Individual-level like personality characteristics are unobservable
- Educational attainment used as a proxy
- Studies on years of schooling \leftrightarrow labour market performance (Bowen and Finegan, 1966; Leigh, 2008; Forbes et al., 2010)
- Education not a good proxy (alternative means)
- Hanushek et al. (2015): positive relationship between higher cognitive skills—measured (numeracy, literacy, and problem-solving skills) and wages across 23 OECD countries.
- Erwin et al. (2020): adults with low literacy and numeracy skills → less likely to work full time and more likely to be unemployed.

- Human capital: "the knowledge, skills, competencies and other attributes embodied in individuals that are relevant to economic activity"
- ▶ Individual-level like personality characteristics are unobservable
- Educational attainment used as a proxy
- Studies on years of schooling \leftrightarrow labour market performance (Bowen and Finegan, 1966; Leigh, 2008; Forbes et al., 2010)
- Education not a good proxy (alternative means)
- Hanushek et al. (2015): positive relationship between higher cognitive skills—measured (numeracy, literacy, and problem-solving skills) and wages across 23 OECD countries.
- Erwin et al. (2020): adults with low literacy and numeracy skills → less likely to work full time and more likely to be unemployed.

- ► Global Financial Crisis (GFC) of 2007-09
- New Zealand experienced a sharp decline in employment, especially between the 2008-Q4 and 2009-Q4
- ► The economically vulnerable groups were the most severely affected (young workers, workers with no/only school qualifications, those with a temporary contract)
- ► Major industries affected: construction, manufacturing, finance and insurance

- ► Global Financial Crisis (GFC) of 2007-09
- New Zealand experienced a sharp decline in employment, especially between the 2008-Q4 and 2009-Q4
- ► The economically vulnerable groups were the most severely affected (young workers, workers with no/only school qualifications, those with a temporary contract)
- Major industries affected: construction, manufacturing, finance and insurance

- ► Global Financial Crisis (GFC) of 2007-09
- New Zealand experienced a sharp decline in employment, especially between the 2008-Q4 and 2009-Q4
- The economically vulnerable groups were the most severely affected (young workers, workers with no/only school qualifications, those with a temporary contract)
- Major industries affected: construction, manufacturing, finance and insurance

- ► Global Financial Crisis (GFC) of 2007-09
- New Zealand experienced a sharp decline in employment, especially between the 2008-Q4 and 2009-Q4
- The economically vulnerable groups were the most severely affected (young workers, workers with no/only school qualifications, those with a temporary contract)
- Major industries affected: construction, manufacturing, finance and insurance

- On 25 March, New Zealand went into a strict (Level 4) lockdown
- ► COVID-19 Wage Subsidy Scheme
- Wage subsidy reached 400 000 by the end of March
- Incidences of permanent layoff and increases in job seeker support (Fletcher, 2020; Fletcher et al., 2021).

- On 25 March, New Zealand went into a strict (Level 4) lockdown
- ► COVID-19 Wage Subsidy Scheme
- ▶ Wage subsidy reached 400 000 by the end of March
- Incidences of permanent layoff and increases in job seeker support (Fletcher, 2020; Fletcher et al., 2021).

- On 25 March, New Zealand went into a strict (Level 4) lockdown
- ► COVID-19 Wage Subsidy Scheme
- ▶ Wage subsidy reached 400 000 by the end of March
- Incidences of permanent layoff and increases in job seeker support (Fletcher, 2020; Fletcher et al., 2021).

- On 25 March, New Zealand went into a strict (Level 4) lockdown
- ► COVID-19 Wage Subsidy Scheme
- ▶ Wage subsidy reached 400 000 by the end of March
- Incidences of permanent layoff and increases in job seeker support (Fletcher, 2020; Fletcher et al., 2021).

- ▶ OECD administers PIAAC in over 40 countries
- ► Focus: assess and analyze skills of the working-age adult population (aged 16 to 65 years).
- Literacy, numeracy, and problem-solving skills in technology-rich environments
- In particular: "broadly transferable (generic) in nature"
- New Zealand participated in the OECD's survey in 2014

- ▶ OECD administers PIAAC in over 40 countries
- ► Focus: assess and analyze skills of the working-age adult population (aged 16 to 65 years).
- Literacy, numeracy, and problem-solving skills in technology-rich environments
- In particular: "broadly transferable (generic) in nature"
- ▶ New Zealand participated in the OECD's survey in 2014

- ▶ OECD administers PIAAC in over 40 countries
- ► Focus: assess and analyze skills of the working-age adult population (aged 16 to 65 years).
- Literacy, numeracy, and problem-solving skills in technology-rich environments
- In particular: "broadly transferable (generic) in nature"
- ▶ New Zealand participated in the OECD's survey in 2014

- ▶ OECD administers PIAAC in over 40 countries
- ► Focus: assess and analyze skills of the working-age adult population (aged 16 to 65 years).
- Literacy, numeracy, and problem-solving skills in technology-rich environments
- In particular: "broadly transferable (generic) in nature"
- ▶ New Zealand participated in the OECD's survey in 2014

- ▶ OECD administers PIAAC in over 40 countries
- ► Focus: assess and analyze skills of the working-age adult population (aged 16 to 65 years).
- Literacy, numeracy, and problem-solving skills in technology-rich environments
- ▶ In particular: "broadly transferable (generic) in nature"
- New Zealand participated in the OECD's survey in 2014

- ► Primary variables: individuals' numeracy and literacy skills, separately measured on a 500-point proficiency score
- 'low-skilled' if their numeracy and literacy scores are both below 200 and higher-skilled otherwise
- ▶ OECD: scores literacy/numeracy below 176 as "Below Level 1" and individuals with scores between 176 and 226 as "Skill Level 1".

- ► Primary variables: individuals' numeracy and literacy skills, separately measured on a 500-point proficiency score
- 'low-skilled' if their numeracy and literacy scores are both below 200 and higher-skilled otherwise
- ▶ OECD: scores literacy/numeracy below 176 as "Below Level 1" and individuals with scores between 176 and 226 as "Skill Level 1".

- ► Primary variables: individuals' numeracy and literacy skills, separately measured on a 500-point proficiency score
- 'low-skilled' if their numeracy and literacy scores are both below 200 and higher-skilled otherwise
- ► OECD: scores literacy/numeracy below 176 as "Below Level 1" and individuals with scores between 176 and 226 as "Skill Level 1".

- ► Inland Revenue EMS data: 2005-09 (GFC) & 2017-20 (Covid-19)
- ► Men aged between 25 and 60
- ► IR-EMS: industry classification, employer's age, firm size, low and higher-paying firm
- ▶ DIA data on marriage/civil union and biological children
- ightharpoonup Border movement data ightarrow physically present in NZ
- Ministry of Education: remove individuals enrolled in tertiary education
- Personal details file: ethnicity, residential address

- ► Inland Revenue EMS data: 2005-09 (GFC) & 2017-20 (Covid-19)
- ► Men aged between 25 and 60
- ► IR-EMS: industry classification, employer's age, firm size, low and higher-paying firm
- ▶ DIA data on marriage/civil union and biological children
- ightharpoonup Border movement data ightarrow physically present in NZ
- Ministry of Education: remove individuals enrolled in tertiary education
- Personal details file: ethnicity, residential address

- ► Inland Revenue EMS data: 2005-09 (GFC) & 2017-20 (Covid-19)
- ► Men aged between 25 and 60
- ► IR-EMS: industry classification, employer's age, firm size, low and higher-paying firm
- ▶ DIA data on marriage/civil union and biological children
- lacktriangle Border movement data ightarrow physically present in NZ
- Ministry of Education: remove individuals enrolled in tertiary education
- Personal details file: ethnicity, residential address

- ► Inland Revenue EMS data: 2005-09 (GFC) & 2017-20 (Covid-19)
- ► Men aged between 25 and 60
- ► IR-EMS: industry classification, employer's age, firm size, low and higher-paying firm
- ▶ DIA data on marriage/civil union and biological children
- lacktriangle Border movement data ightarrow physically present in NZ
- Ministry of Education: remove individuals enrolled in tertiary education
- Personal details file: ethnicity, residential address

- ► Inland Revenue EMS data: 2005-09 (GFC) & 2017-20 (Covid-19)
- ► Men aged between 25 and 60
- ► IR-EMS: industry classification, employer's age, firm size, low and higher-paying firm
- ▶ DIA data on marriage/civil union and biological children
- ▶ Border movement data → physically present in NZ
- Ministry of Education: remove individuals enrolled in tertiary education
- Personal details file: ethnicity, residential address

Data and sample selection

Integrated Data Infrastructure (IDI)

- ► Inland Revenue EMS data: 2005-09 (GFC) & 2017-20 (Covid-19)
- ► Men aged between 25 and 60
- ► IR-EMS: industry classification, employer's age, firm size, low and higher-paying firm
- ▶ DIA data on marriage/civil union and biological children
- ightharpoonup Border movement data ightarrow physically present in NZ
- Ministry of Education: remove individuals enrolled in tertiary education
- Personal details file: ethnicity, residential address

Data and sample selection

Integrated Data Infrastructure (IDI)

- ► Inland Revenue EMS data: 2005-09 (GFC) & 2017-20 (Covid-19)
- ► Men aged between 25 and 60
- ► IR-EMS: industry classification, employer's age, firm size, low and higher-paying firm
- ▶ DIA data on marriage/civil union and biological children
- ▶ Border movement data → physically present in NZ
- Ministry of Education: remove individuals enrolled in tertiary education
- Personal details file: ethnicity, residential address

Data and sample selection

Wage progression

Table: Wage progression

	GFC period				COVID-19 period			
Δ_{year}	low skill	higher-skilled	diff	Δ_{year}	low skill	higher-skilled	diff	
Panel A: Full Sample								
2005/06	0.051	0.033	0.018	2017/18	0.028	0.032	-0.005	
	(0.013)	(0.003)	(0.012)		(0.013)	(0.002)	(0.012)	
2006/07	0.066	0.036	0.030***	2018/19	0.038	0.037	0.001	
	(0.013)	(0.003)	(0.011)		(0.013)	(0.002)	(0.012)	
2007/08	-0.007	0.034	-0.041***	2019/20	0.015	0.020	-0.005	
	(0.012)	(0.003)	(0.000)		(0.015)	(0.003)	(0.013)	
2008/09	-0.012	0.007	-0.019*					
	(0.011)	(0.002)	(0.011)					
Panel B:	Low earn	nings	, ,					
2005/06	0.183	0.159	0.024	2017/18	0.109	0.116	-0.007	
	(0.02)	(0.142)	(0.024)		(0.019)	(0.007)	(0.021)	
2006/07	0.172	0.142	0.030	2018/19	0.124	0.13	-0.006	
	(0.021)	(0.008)	(0.022)		(0.019)	(0.007)	(0.021)	
2007/08	0.080	0.144	-0.064***	2019/20	0.113	0.117	-0.004	
	(0.018)	(800.0)	(0.022)		(0.023)	(0.007)	(0.024)	
2008/09	0.046	0.111	-0.065***					
,	(0.016)	(0.008)	(0.019)					

Empirical identification strategy

$$\Delta_{y_{i,t}} = \beta \operatorname{HS}_i + \sum_{\operatorname{year}} \delta \operatorname{year}_{i,t} + \sum_{\operatorname{year}} \theta \operatorname{year}_{i,t} \times \operatorname{HS}_i + \eta X_{i(t-12)} + u_{it}$$

$$\text{(1)}$$
with $\Delta_{y_{i,t}} = \log(y_{i,t}) - \log(y_{i,t-12})$

Results

Regression results

Table: Regression results

	GFC period			COVID-19 period	
	total	low earnings		total	low earnings
HS	0.026	-0.011	HS	0.052***	0.031
	(0.017)	(0.028)		(0.017)	(0.025)
2006/07	0.014	-0.001	2018/19	0.015	0.014
	(0.024)	(0.035)		(0.024)	(0.036)
2007/08	-0.058**	-0.096***	2019/20	-0.001	0.019
	(0.026)	(0.033)		(0.025)	(0.035)
2008/09	-0.069***	-0.133***			
	(0.023)	(0.031)			
HS × 2006/07	-0.011	-0.013	HS × 2018/19	-0.008	0.003
	(0.024)	(0.038)		(0.024)	(0.038)
HS × 2007/08	0.062**	0.082**	HS × 2019/20	-0.008	-0.008
	(0.027)	(0.037)		(0.025)	(0.038)
HS × 2008/09	0.046**	0.085**			
	(0.023)	(0.034)			

Results

Changes of wage progression over time

Table: Changes of wage progression over time

	GFC period					COVID-19 period			
	low skill		higher skill			low skill		higher skill	
Δ_{year}	total	low earnings	total	low earnings	Δ_{year}	total	low earnings	total	low earnings
2005/06	reference			2017/18	reference				
2006/07	0.014	-0.001	0.003	-0.014	2018/19	0.015	0.014	0.007*	0.017
	(0.024)	(0.035)	(0.005)	(0.015)		(0.024)	(0.036)	(0.004)	(0.012)
2007/08	-0.058**	-0.096***	0.003	-0.013	2019/20	-0.001	0.019	-0.009**	0.010
	(0.026)	(0.033)	(0.005)	(0.016)		(0.025)	(0.035)	(0.004)	(0.013)
2008/09	-0.069***	-0.133***	-0.023***	-0.048***					
	(0.023)	(0.031)	(0.005)	(0.015)					

Results Marginal effects

Table: Marginal effects

	GFC	period		COVID-19 period		
Δ_{year}	total	low earnings		total	low earnings	
2005/06	0.026	-0.011	2017/18	0.052***	0.031	
	(0.017)	(0.028)		(0.017)	(0.025)	
2006/07	0.015	-0.024	2018/19	0.045**	0.034	
	(0.019)	(0.028)		(0.019)	(0.027)	
2007/08	0.088***	0.071***	2019/20	0.044**	0.023	
	(0.019)	(0.027)		(0.018)	(0.029)	
2008/09	0.072***	0.074***				
	(0.019)	(0.025)				

Results Robustness test

- Skill-score cut-off
- ► Cut-off point to define the low earnings group
- ► Separate regressions by skill type

Results Robustness test

- Skill-score cut-off
- ► Cut-off point to define the low earnings group
- ► Separate regressions by skill type

Results Robustness test

- Skill-score cut-off
- ► Cut-off point to define the low earnings group
- ► Separate regressions by skill type

Results Mechanisms

Table: Regression results by employer

	GFC period					
	Same	employer	Changed employer			
	total low earnings		total	low earnings		
HS	0.043***	0.017	-0.040	-0.109**		
	(0.016)	(0.030)	(0.041)	(0.052)		
2006/07	0.021	-0.005	-0.047	-0.073		
	(0.025)	(0.038)	(0.048)	(0.051)		
2007/08	-0.027	-0.058	-0.182***	-0.241***		
	(0.029)	(0.042)	(0.054)	(0.056)		
2008/09	-0.040*	-0.084**	-0.165***	-0.316***		
	(0.024)	(0.034)	(0.046)	(0.073)		
$HS \times 2006/07$	-0.018	-0.011	0.050	0.091		
	(0.025)	(0.042)	(0.051)	(0.060)		
$HS \times 2007/08$	0.028	0.033	0.192***	0.267***		
	(0.030)	(0.045)	(0.057)	(0.066)		
HS × 2008/09	0.016	0.033	0.151***	0.331***		
	(0.024)	(0.038)	(0.049)	(0.080)		

Results Mechanisms

Table: Regression results by employer

	GFC period					
	Same	employer	Changed employe			
	total low earnings		total	low earnings		
	Covid-19 period					
HS	0.055***	0.047	0.012	-0.055		
	(0.017)	(0.029)	(0.056)	(0.064)		
2018/19	-0.012	0.030	0.111*	-0.052		
•	(0.025)	(0.041)	(0.062)	(0.092)		
2019/20	0.008	0.030	-0.077	-0.095		
·	(0.023)	(0.041)	(0.075)	(0.102)		
HS × 2018/19	0.019	-0.016	-0.102	0.079		
	(0.025)	(0.042)	(0.064)	(0.097)		
HS × 2019/20	-0.021	-0.020	0.084	0.132		
•	(0.024)	(0.043)	(0.076)	(0.107)		

- ► Are cognitive skills adequate safeguards during unanticipated adverse economic shocks?
- ▶ OECD's PIAAC survey of individuals' numeracy and literacy skills and linking it with the IDI
- ► GFC: shock on wage progression lower for the higher skilled (employer change)
- ► Covid-19: no differences in wage progression across skill levels

- ► Are cognitive skills adequate safeguards during unanticipated adverse economic shocks?
- ▶ OECD's PIAAC survey of individuals' numeracy and literacy skills and linking it with the IDI
- ► GFC: shock on wage progression lower for the higher skilled (employer change)
- ► Covid-19: no differences in wage progression across skill levels

- ► Are cognitive skills adequate safeguards during unanticipated adverse economic shocks?
- ▶ OECD's PIAAC survey of individuals' numeracy and literacy skills and linking it with the IDI
- ► GFC: shock on wage progression lower for the higher skilled (employer change)
- Covid-19: no differences in wage progression across skill levels

- ► Are cognitive skills adequate safeguards during unanticipated adverse economic shocks?
- ▶ OECD's PIAAC survey of individuals' numeracy and literacy skills and linking it with the IDI
- ► GFC: shock on wage progression lower for the higher skilled (employer change)
- ► Covid-19: no differences in wage progression across skill levels